

ESTABLISHMENT COMMITTEE
Thursday, 30 January 2020

Minutes of the meeting of the Establishment Committee held at Guildhall on
Thursday, 30 January 2020 at 11.00 am

Present

Members:

Deputy Edward Lord (Chair)
Deputy Kevin Everett (Deputy Chairman)
Randall Anderson
Deputy Keith Bottomley
Alderman Sir Charles Bowman
Tracey Graham
Deputy the Revd Stephen Haines
Sheriff Christopher Hayward
Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark
Deputy Joyce Nash
Barbara Newman
Deputy Elizabeth Rogula
Ruby Sayed
Deputy Philip Woodhouse

Officers:

Angela Roach	- Assistant Town Clerk
Kristina Drake	- Media Officer
Michael Cogher	- Comptroller and City Solicitor
Chrissie Morgan	- Director of Human Resources
Janet Fortune	- Town Clerk's Department
Tracey Jansen	- Human Resources
Marion Afoakwa	-
Simon Latham	-
Grace Rawnsley	- Community Education Officer
Kate Smith	- Town Clerk's Department
Laura Tuckey	-

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Sylvia Moys and Deputy Richard Regan. Apologies for lateness were received from Alderman Sir Charles Bowman.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations of interest.

3. MINUTES

RESOLVED – That the public minutes and summary of the meeting held on 10 December 2019, be approved as an accurate record.

4. **OUTSTANDING ACTIONS REPORT**

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk which provided details of outstanding actions from previous meetings.

Members noted that item 2, Job Families, would be better subsumed into the ongoing work for the Fundamental Review and target operating model. It was felt that changes were likely to be made that would have an impact on a number of areas, including Job Families and the Director of Human Resources felt it would be unhelpful to consider this particular area in isolation.

RESOLVED – That the Committee notes the report.

5. **BREXIT UPDATE**

Members heard from the Director of Human Resources that there was no update on BREXIT at this time. Members agreed there would likely be more report after the UK left the European Union on 31 January 2020.

6. **2020/21 PAY POLICY**

Members considered a report of the Director of Human Resources regarding the 2020/21 Pay Policy Statement.

At its meeting on 5 December 2019, the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee proposed that the last sentence of paragraph 3 of the Statement be extended to include: “...and are outside the scope of the Act”. This amendment was supported by officers and by Members.

Members discussed how suggestions made at the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee had been recorded and were concerned that these changes had not been picked up in the version presented to them for approval. In light of the Court of Common Council’s decision to minimise minutes to decision only, Members agreed that in future they would need to be explicit when their observations should be recorded as resolutions.

11.07 – Sheriff Christopher Hayward, Deputy the Revd Stephen Haines and Barbara Newman joined the meeting.

The Director of Human Resources explained that the current document presented to the Committee for approval was a compliant document that replicated other local authority pay policies. For 2021/22, further revisions would be made to the document, so it more accurately captured the City of London Corporation’s terms of governance. Members were satisfied that the bulk of the proposals discussed at the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee would be captured in next year’s policy, however, they agreed that two revisions should be made to the current document including oversight of Incentive Schemes and the authority of the Establishment Committee.

RESOLVED – that,

- Paragraph 3 of the Pay Policy Statement 2020/21 be revised to reflect changes proposed by the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee;
- The Statement be updated to incorporate:
 - i) Oversight of all Incentive Scheme or Bonus arrangements in operation within the Corporation; and
 - ii) That the Establishment Committee has the authority to use its discretion where it is appropriate, and will report use of such discretion on an annual basis
- Subject to these amendments, the Pay Policy 2020/21 be approved in principle; and
- Final approval of the Pay Policy Statement 2020/21 be delegated to the Town Clerk in consultation with the Chair and Deputy Chairman, for onward submission to the Policy & Resources Committee.

7. DEPARTMENTAL BUDGET ESTIMATES AND HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY BUSINESS PLAN 2020-21

Members considered a joint report of the Town Clerk, the Chamberlain and the Comptroller and City Solicitor regarding the Departmental Budget Estimates and High-Level Summary Business Plan 2020-21.

Members discussed the format in which the financial data had been presented to them and a number found it overwhelming and felt that it failed to provide adequate commentary to some of the key variances from the Committee's original budget. For example, a query was raised as to why the original budget of £6,000 assigned to Local Risk income for "Other Grants, Reimbursements and Contributions", had increased to £3,377,000. In addition to this, Members felt that there was a lack of clear priorities. Members noted that there would be no in-year budget increases and therefore it was imperative for the budget reports to be sufficient in enabling the Committee to make its decision. On that basis, Members agreed to pass a resolution to the Finance Committee recommending that the format and presentation of budget reports be reconsidered to feature a single-side high level summary.

With regard to unidentified savings referred to in paragraph 7 of the report, Members were assured that they would be provided with greater detail on this in the mid-year report.

A question was raised about the Corporate Performance Framework and when measurable targets would be reported. Members heard that there had been a significant effort put into establishing a consistency of reporting across the Corporation which would ultimately enable the City to allocate its attention and money to the right places. There had been a huge cultural and technological shift and it was the ambition of the Town Clerk to have some initial targets prepared for the July 2020 Resource Allocation Sub-Committee Away Day.

Concern was raised over recommendation iii), which to Members' minds was a completely uncapped delegation and should not be supported. Members agreed that it would be appropriate for the terms "further" and "minor" in recommendations iii) and iv), to be revised to "immaterial".

11.48 – Alderman Sir Charles Bowman joined the meeting.

RESOLVED – that,

- it be recommended to the Finance Committee that the format of the Departmental Budget Estimates be reconsidered to include an overview of headline priorities and a commentary outlining material changes to the Budget, with the intention of enabling Committees to make better informed decisions;
- the Town Clerks, and Comptrollers and City Solicitors Department's proposed revenue budget for 2020-21 for submission to Finance Committee, be approved;
- the Town Clerks and Comptrollers and City Solicitors Department's proposed capital and supplementary revenue projects budgets for 2020-21 for submission to Finance Committee, be approved;
- the Chamberlain, in consultation with the Town Clerk, Comptroller and City Solicitors and Chairs of both the Service Committee and Finance Committee, be authorised to revise these budgets to allow for any immaterial implications arising from Corporate Projects, other reviews and changes to the Cyclical Works Programme;
- agree that immaterial amendments for 2019-20 and 2020-21 budgets arising during budget setting be delegated to the Chamberlain;
- the factors taken into consideration in compiling the Corporate & Members Services, Human Resources and Comptrollers and City Solicitors Department's Business Plan, including efficiency measures, be noted; and
- the final high-level summary Business Plans for 2020-21, be approved.

8. FUNDING FOR CITY OF LONDON CORPORATION STAFF SPORTS AND ACTIVITIES CLUB (COLSSAC)

Members considered a report of the Town Clerk regarding the City of London Corporation Sports and Activities Club (COLSSAC).

Members discussed the current budget, activities and attendee levels. Members supported the proposal that £800 per year would be granted to go towards the expense of City of London branded sports t-shirts for sponsored charity events.

Members heard about the children's party and were dismayed to hear that COLSSAC were obliged to use expensive catering firms under current arrangements.

RESOLVED, that –

- The funding to the COLSSAC, at an increased cost of £17,208 per year, for the next three years (2020/21 to 2022/23) totalling £51,624, be approved;
- Authority be delegated to the Town Clerk, in consultation with the Chair and Deputy Chairman, to approve a sum of £800 per year, for the next three years (2020/21 to 2022/23) totalling £2,400, for the provision of City of London branded sports t-shirts for sponsored charity events, subject to sufficient funds being identified within City's Cash Grants; and
- The Chamberlain be asked to consider whether it is necessary for COLSSAC to use fixed catering contractors for their Children's Party.

9. **PROPOSAL TO CHANGE THE NAME OF THE GRAND COMMITTEE**

Members considered a report of the Town Clerk regarding a proposal to change the name of the Grand Committee.

RESOLVED, that

- consideration of the Committee's name be deferred until the outcome of the Governance Review had been established; and
- an urgent informal meeting of the Committee be called, to consider what recommendations, if any, the Establishment Committee might make to Lord Lisvane for the Governance Review.

10. **ESTABLISHMENT COMMITTEE - TERMS OF REFERENCE REVIEW**

Members considered a report of the Town Clerk regarding the Establishment Committees Terms of Reference.

Members agreed that no changes should be made to the terms of reference or the Committee's frequency of meetings at this time. It was noted that the terms of reference would be brought back for consideration following the outcome of the Governance Review.

RESOLVED, that

- The terms of reference of the Committee, be approved for submission to the Court of Common Council in April 2020.

12.23 – Sheriff Christopher Hayward left the meeting.

11. **HR HELPDESK SOFTWARE**

Members received a joint report of the Chamberlain and Director of Human Resources regarding the HR Helpdesk Software.

RESOLVED, that

- The report be noted; and
- The report be referred to the Digital Services Sub-Committee.

12. PUBLIC MINUTES OF THE JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE (JCC)

12.1 Public Minutes of the Joint Consultative Committee - 10th December 2019

RESOLVED, that the public minutes of the Joint Consultative Committee meeting held on 10 December 2019, be noted.

12.2 Public Minutes of the Joint Consultative Committee (Employer Side only) - 15th January 2020

RESOLVED – that the public minutes of the Joint Consultative Committee (Employer Side Only) meeting held on 15 January 2020, be noted.

13. PUBLIC MINUTES OF THE SENIOR REMUNERATION SUB-COMMITTEE - 5TH DECEMBER 2019

RESOLVED – that the public minutes of the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee meeting held on 5 December 2019, be noted.

14. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

There were no questions.

15. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIR CONSIDERS URGENT

The following items of urgent business were raised –

Members noted that the Celebrating our People Awards would be taking place on 30 September 2020.

Members noted the resolution of the Court of Common Council to the Establishment Committee regarding the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) definition on Anti-Semitism.

RESOLVED – that the IHRA definition of anti-Semitism, including the following agreed working examples, be adopted within the Officers' Code of Conduct as an annex.

IHRA Definition of Anti-Semitism

“Antisemitism is a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical manifestations of antisemitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or

their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities.”

IHRA Working Examples

Manifestations might include the targeting of the state of Israel, conceived as a Jewish collectivity. However, criticism of Israel similar to that levelled against any other country cannot be regarded as antisemitic. Antisemitism frequently charges Jews with conspiring to harm humanity, and it is often used to blame Jews for “why things go wrong.” It is expressed in speech, writing, visual forms and action, and employs sinister stereotypes and negative character traits.

Contemporary examples of antisemitism in public life, the media, schools, the workplace, and in the religious sphere could, taking into account the overall context, include, but are not limited to:

- Calling for, aiding, or justifying the killing or harming of Jews in the name of a radical ideology or an extremist view of religion.
- Making mendacious, dehumanizing, demonizing, or stereotypical allegations about Jews as such or the power of Jews as collective — such as, especially but not exclusively, the myth about a world Jewish conspiracy or of Jews controlling the media, economy, government or other societal institutions.
- Accusing Jews as a people of being responsible for real or imagined wrongdoing committed by a single Jewish person or group, or even for acts committed by non-Jews.
- Denying the fact, scope, mechanisms (e.g. gas chambers) or intentionality of the genocide of the Jewish people at the hands of National Socialist Germany and its supporters and accomplices during World War II (the Holocaust).
- Accusing the Jews as a people, or Israel as a state, of inventing or exaggerating the Holocaust.
- Accusing Jewish citizens of being more loyal to Israel, or to the alleged priorities of Jews worldwide, than to the interests of their own nations.
- Denying the Jewish people their right to self-determination, e.g., by claiming that the existence of a State of Israel is a racist endeavour.
- Applying double standards by requiring of it a behaviour not expected or demanded of any other democratic nation.
- Using the symbols and images associated with classic antisemitism (e.g., claims of Jews killing Jesus or blood libel) to characterize Israel or Israelis.

- Drawing comparisons of contemporary Israeli policy to that of the Nazis.
- Holding Jews collectively responsible for actions of the state of Israel.

Antisemitic acts are criminal when they are so defined by law (for example, denial of the Holocaust or distribution of antisemitic materials in some countries).

Criminal acts are antisemitic when the targets of attacks, whether they are people or property – such as buildings, schools, places of worship and cemeteries – are selected because they are, or are perceived to be, Jewish or linked to Jews.

Antisemitic discrimination is the denial to Jews of opportunities or services available to others and is illegal in many countries.

16. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

RESOLVED – That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

17. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

RESOLVED – that the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2019, be approved as an accurate record.

18. **OUTSTANDING ACTIONS REPORT**

The Committee noted a report of the Town Clerk which provided details of non-public outstanding actions from previous meetings.

19. **STAFF SURVEY ACTION PLANS**

Members received a report of the Town Clerk regarding the Pulse Staff Survey Action Plan update.

20. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES OF THE JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE - 10TH DECEMBER 2019**

RESOLVED – that the non-public minutes of the meeting of the Joint Consultative Committee held on 10 December 2019, be noted.

21. **NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

There were no questions.

22. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIR CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

There were no items of urgent business.

23. **HONORARIUM REQUEST**

Members considered a report of the Chamberlain regarding an Honorarium request.

24. **CONFIDENTIAL MINUTES**
RESOLVED – that the confidential minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2019, be approved.
25. **CONFIDENTIAL MINUTES OF THE JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE (EMPLOYER SIDE ONLY) - 15TH JANUARY 2020**
RESOLVED – that the confidential minutes of the Joint Consultative Committee (Employer Side Only) meeting held on 15 January 2020, be noted.
26. **CONFIDENTIAL MINUTES OF THE SENIOR REMUNERATION SUB-COMMITTEE - 5TH DECEMBER 2019**
RESOLVED – that the confidential minutes of the Senior Remuneration Sub-Committee meeting held on 5 December 2019, be noted.
27. **CHAIR'S APPRAISAL UPDATE**
The Deputy Chairman gave an update to the Committee regarding the Chair's Appraisal.
28. **TOWN CLERK'S UPDATE**
There were no updates to be heard.
29. **CONFIDENTIAL QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**
There was one question.

The meeting ended at 12.58 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Polly Dunn
Tel.: 0207 332 3726
john.cater@cityoflondon.gov.uk